THE IMPLEMENTATION OF PROJECT BASED LEARNING IN COURSEBOOK EVALUATION CLASSROOM

Yanuarti Apsari¹, Ida Lisdawati², Euis Rina Mulyani³

^{1,2,3} IKIP Siliwangi, Cimahi, Indonesia

¹ greengo288@gmail.com, ² idalisdawati9088@gmail.com, ³ euisrinamulyani@gmail.com

ABSTRAK

Berfikir kritis adalah sebuah keterampilan yang harus dikembangkan oleh mahasiswa di perguruan tinggi. Project-based learning dapat digunakan untuk meningkatkan kemampuan berfikir kritis mahasiswa. Artikel ini menginvestigasi penerapan project based learning pada mata kuliah coursebook evaluation di sebuah perguruan tinggi. Tujuan penelitian ini adalah untuk 1) mendeskripsikan penerapan Project based learning di kelas Coursebook evaluation dan 2) untuk menginvestigasi kesulitan siswa selama penerapan Project based learning. Desain penelitian ini adalah deskriptif kualitatif. Subjek penelitian ini adalah mahasiswa semester 4 yang sedang mengambil mata kuliah course book evaluation. Data dikumpulkan melalui observasi, wawancara dan hasil proyek mahasiswa. Hasil dari penelitian menunjukkan bahwa penerapan Project-Based Learning di kelas Coursebook Evaluation dilakukan melalui beberapa tahapan: (1) mendiskusikan materi tentang Coursebook Evaluation, (2) mengevaluasi buku ajar secara berkelompok, (3) membuat laporan, (4) membuat video, and (5) mempresentasikan video. Selain itu, hasil dari interview juga mengungkapkan bahwa ada tiga masalah yang ditemui oleh responden selama pelaksanaan project based learning: menemukan informasi yang sesuai, menulis laporan dan membuat video.

Kata Kunci: Project based Learning, Penerapan, Masalah

ABSTRACT

Critical thinking is a crucial skill that university students need to develop. Project-based learning can be used to promote students' critical thinking. The paper investigates the implementation of project based learning in Coursebook Evaluation course at a university setting. The purposes of this research study were: 1) to describe the implementation of Project based learning in Coursebook evaluation classroom and 2) to investigate the students' difficulties during the implementation of Project based learning. The design of the research was descriptive qualitative. The subjects were the fourth semester students who were taking course book evaluation. The data were collected through observation, interview and students' project. The findings showed that the implementation Project-Based Learning in Coursebook Evaluation class are through the following steps: (1) Discussing the materials about Course Book Evaluation, (2) working with the group in evaluating English Course Book, (3) creating the paper, (4) creating the video, and (5) presenting the video product. Moreover, the data from interview also revealed that there were three problems encountered by the respondents during the implementation of project based learning: finding appropriate information, writing the paper and creating the video.

Keywords: Project based Learning, Implementation, Problems

How to Cite: Apsari, Y, Lisdawati, I & Mulyani, E.R. (2019). The Implementation Of Project Based Learning In Coursebook Evaluation Classroom. *Jurnal P2M STKIP Siliwangi*, 6 (2), 187-195.

INTRODUCTION

The fourth semester students of IKIP Siliwangi are required to take coursebook evaluation course. The ability to think critically is an outcome generally expected of graduates from tertiary education. The objectives of the course are to provide the students with knowledge, skills and the basic principles of

evaluating English coursebook. In addition, at the end of the course the students are required to practice in evaluating English coursebook. Thus, the students are expected to be able to evaluate English coursebook. As the candidates of teacher, they must be able to selects a good materials that are relevant to curriculum 2013. Therefore, in this

subject the students need to be trained on evaluating an English coursebook.

Coursebook evaluation is the activity in identifying the strengths and weaknesseses of a coursebook. In Indonesia, it was an undeniable fact that some English textbooks published met the standards and criteria of good textbooks and some others did not. Good English textbooks were usually not only visually appealing and attractively presented, but also met the criteria of good English textbooks determined by the curriculum. Thus, Evaluating EFL textbook is crucial to conduct in order to ensure ELT textbooks can effectively achieve the teaching objectives.

However, choosing the appropriate coursebook is one of the most challenging tasks for teachers. Since evaluating coursebooks requires the critical thinking. Project-based learning fosters students to critical thinking. Neo and Neo (2009, p. 254) argue that PBL has been enhanced the students" interest, critical thinking abilities, presentation skills, communicative skills and the ability to work on a team. According to Fragoulis (2009), Project-based learning requires students to solve problems using a higher order critical thinking skill. It is in line with the statement of Krauss and Boss (2013) that through project based learning can cause students to get engaged in critical thinking in order to construct their own meaning by applying what they learn. Thus, this study is aimed at answering the following questions: 1) how is Project based learning implemented in coursebook evaluation class? 2) what are students' difficulties in creating the project.

The Introduction presents the purpose of the studies reported and their relationship to earlier work in the field. It should not be an extensive review of the literature. Use only those references required to provide the most salient background to allow the readers to understand and evaluate the purpose and results of the present study without referring to previous publications on the topic.

Coursebook

Coursebook plays a crucial role in teaching. Especially in English language teaching, the coursebooks take on a special role, as they become the most easily available opportunity for students to practice and function in the target language. In Indonesia, using a coursebook is a must for every school to support the learning process. As stated in the regulations of the

Minister of Education no. 11 of 2005 Article 8 that teachers can suggest students have textbooks. This means that the government is clearly called for each learner has a textbook in order to achieve the learning process. In other words, course books are considered as the main components of the curriculum in Indonesia. National Education Department develops the content, the methods, and the procedures for teaching and learning in the classroom.

Furthermore, Chou (2010) adds that the advantages of using coursebook are having a well-organized materials suited to the topics and genres for the four skill area, teachers who implement a coursebook may find it easier to teach because most of the preparation of teaching (e.g. types of activities, audios, achievement tests) are already existed. This will help inexperienced teachers who are just getting started into teaching.

Moreover, the field of language teaching has faced very crucial changes that have had a great effect on methods and approaches. Every year different coursebooks are chosen to make a course more effective in terms of learning strategies. According to Beare (2011), choosing the right coursebook is one of the crucial tasks that teachers need to carry out. This means that the wrong choice of textbooks would be likely to negatively affect both teaching and learning. In this case, teachers should have the skill of considering the appropriateness of language level, content/topic, activities and logical sequences of a coursebook (Bertin, 2011).

Project Based Learning

Project-based learning is based the constructivist learning theory, which finds that learning is deeper and more meaningful when students are involved in constructing their own knowledge. Project-Based Learning approach as a systematic teaching approach that engages students in learning knowledge and skill through an extended inquiry process structured around complex, authentic questions and carefully designed products and tasks (Markham, 2003).

In project-based learning, traditional teacher roles can be challenged as students make choices on how to approach a problem, present findings or identify what the driving question or questions will be (Bender, 2012). According to Essien (2018), there are three stages such as planning, implementing and presenting stage. Furthermore, Simpson (2011) adds that in project-based

learning, students are urged to plan, complete, and present the task. In planning stage, there are several activities in order to help students to create authentic, engaging and relevant projects, the teachers should guide the students through sequence of preparation steps as stated by Miller (2011:35).

In addition, the activities in the implementing stage includes forming team, developing project ideas, collecting data, share roles in groups, and carry out projects. In this stage, the students are responsible to collect information, analyze and interpret data, and present them as the outcome of their learning (Simpson, 2011). In project-based learning, the students are responsible for their own learning. They drive their own learning through inquiry, as well as work collaboratively to create projects that reflect their knowledge (Bell, 2010).

Furthermore, Reinders and White (2011) state that technology is a tool that helps learners and educators to achieve certain educational goals. Therefore, the teachers are recommended to accommodate technology in teaching and learning process (Suherdi, 2012) as cited in Apsari and Satriani (2016). In accommodating technology based learning for students, Furthermore, Hafner and Miller (2011) claim that the digital video project tasks appear to have been highly motivational for students since the students' comments on the video projects have revealed that the tasks provided students with an opportunity to reflect on their learning, and they have found the digital video projects to be novel, fun, challenging, and meaningful.

There are many advantages that the students and the teacher can get from implementing PBL approach in the classroom. Project-Based Learning approach helps students develop their higher thinking skill because in PBL, students have to analyze and interpret data that lead them to have deep understanding about the topic. Poject-based learning usually results in building learners' confidence, self-esteem, and autonomy as well as improving students' language skills, content learning, and cognitive abilities (Ponpoon, 2011). addition. Thomas, Michealson Mergendoller (2002) indicate that Project-based learning engages students in gaining knowledge and skills through an extended inquiry process structured around complex, authentic questions and carefully designed products and tasks.

Based on the objectives of this study, thus, this study is aimed at answering the following questions: 1) how is Project based learning implemented in coursebook evaluation class? 2) what are students' difficulties in creating the project.

METHOD

Relevant to the purposes of the research, the researcher used descriptive qualitative research which is considered appropriate in order to obtain information related to the implementation of such technique, media, approach, and method (Nunan, 1992). This research design was employed to describe the implementation of Project-Based Learning approach in teaching coursebook evaluation, and discover the students' difficulties during the implementation of Project-Based Learning approach.

This study was conducted at a private university in Cimahi, West Java. The site was chosen because the researchers were teaching staffs at the University so that the results of this study were expected to make a real contribution to better learning activities. The subjects of the study were second grade students of the English language education study program who were taking coursebook evaluation subject.

In gaining the data, the researchers used several instruments such as observation, final project of the product and interview. Observation was performed to get description of context in which the teaching and learning process happened. Then, the interview was used to obtain the data about what the students said about their experience in evaluating English coursebook through Project based learning and their obstacles from compleing the project. Finally, students' projects were used to support the main source of data in answering the research questions. The use of these multiple data collection techniques to establish the validity as the realization of triangulation (Maxwell, 1996).

1. Classroom observation

In qualitative research, one of the primary data resources is observation (Silverman, 2005). The classroom observation was conducted for twelve sessions in which the researcher acted as 'a teacher as a researcher and take part in the setting they are being observed (Fraenkel and Wallen, 1993: 390-391). It was aimed at observing and understanding the natural environment as lived by the participants without altering or manipulating it (Gay et al.,

2009). Classroom observation was particularly aimed to explore three phenomena: to explore what the students do in the planning stage of the project, to explore what the students do in carrying out the project, and to explore what the students do in reviewing and monitoring stage of the project.

2. Interview

Interview was used to gain specific information or very useful data about students' feeling or opinion which is not accessible through observation (Merriam, 1998) as cited in Apsari (2018). This interview was given after the teaching and learning process; it consists of 11 questions. The form of interview is divided into 3 parts as follows:

- a. 1. Part 1 (number 1-3) deals with Project-Based Learning approach and students' responses towards it.
- b. 2. Part 2 (number 4-8) is about teaching learning process in the class and students' responses about it.
- c. 3. Part 3 (number 9-11) deals with students' difficulties during completing the project.

The data from students' interview were qualitatively analyzed and the interview questions were put into categories based on the themes in line with the purpose of this study.

3. Video Project

In this study, students' final project were analyzed. In this study, the final project was a video from the result of evaluating english textbook. students' project were used to gain information regarding students' difficulties in completing the task. As Nunan (1999) contends that this is done because in general, students' portfolios works provided concrete instances of learner's achievements.

All the data obtained in this study were analyzed by based on the relevance topic of research questions. Then, they were categorized into three main central themes, i.e. The implementation of project based learning and students' difficulties in doing project based learning

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

Based on the data from observation, the implementation of project based learning in teaching coursebook evaluation is divided into three stages such as planning, implementing and presenting stages as proposed by by Essien (2018). It was set out for twelve sessions starting from

March to June 2019 and the duration for each meeting was 90 minutes.

In this subject, referring to the syllabus in the first meeting until seventh meeting the students were prepared some theories about the characteristics of a good textbook and some model for evaluating textbook from several experts. Then, the implementation of project based learning was started in eight meeting.

The stages of the implementation of Project based Learning in teaching coursebook Evaluation is described below.

- 1. Planning stage
 - a. Introducing the teaching program
 - b. designing a plan for project
 - c. Discussing the teaching material
- 2. Implementing stage
 - a. Forming group
 - b. starting with essential question
 - c. developing the project
 - d. monitoring the students and progress of the project
 - e. providing feedback to the students' project
- 3. Presenting stage
 - a. Presenting students' project
 - b. Assessing the students' project

In addition, regarding to the aim of the research, this research also revealed that the students had difficulties in finding appropriate information, writing the paper and creating the video.

Discussion

The Implementation of Project Based Learning in Coursebook Evaluation

The data from observation showed that there are three stages in impementing project based learning in coursebook evaluation classroom. The stages will be explained below.

1. Planning Stage

The activities in the planning stage comprised the introduction to Project Based Learning and discussing the topics of teaching material. The use of project-based learning in class is possible after providing the information that is needed for the project. In the first meeting, the lecturer introduced the students to the program. It was conducted mainly for providing overall information and explicit direction regarding the course, and for giving explanation of the purpose of classroom activities. The information covered the schedule and the length of the course that would take 12 meetings at least 90 minutes for each session.

Other requirements necessary for the study such as taking part in being active in the classroom, comprehending the material of coursebook evaluation, writing the paper weekly, creating the project or video and presenting the project.

In addition, seven topics were offered to the students in each meeting. The topics includes curriculum, syllabus and coursebook, the role of coursebook, the use of coursebook in the classroom, the advantages and disadvantages of using course book, the characteristics of a good coursebook, evaluation models for coursebook. In addition, the students were required to get better understanding toward the topics. Since the involvement in the study were students' emphasized that the lecturer used various techniques in planning stage such as teacher presentation, question and answer technique and quiz. The activities are shown in the following figures.



Figure 1.Teacher presentation



Figure 2. Question and answer Technique



Figure 3. Quiz

In each meeting the lecturer plays a role as facilitator, the students were guided to comprehend the topic. It is in line with the statement of Miller (2011:35) that in order to help students to create authentic, engaging and relevant projects, the teachers should guide the students through sequence of preparation steps.

2. Implementing Stage

The implementing stage was conducted for eight meeting. After the students had discussed the material and got the comprehensive points on the theories used for evaluating coursebook, the lecturer divided the students into several groups. Then, the students were asked to evaluate the English coursebook. In this case, they are given the opportunity to select the the textbook freely. Furthermore, the result of evaluating English coursebook need to be made in the form of the paper and video. In other words, the project was video making and carried out in groups.

In evaluating English Coursebook, there are many evaluation models proposed by the experts. Then, the lecturer gave the freedom to select the model evaluation. Finally, they agreed to evaluate the English textbook based following categories: (1) aims and approaches, (2) design and organization, (3) language content, (4) skills, (5) topic, and (6) methodology a proposed by (Cunningsworth, 1995).

Furthermore, in this stage the students were required to write the paper collaboratively in a group. The paper covers the results of evaluating English coursebook. During class observation, students with different level of skill worked together to discuss each aspect of the coursebook, evaluate each aspect by relating to the theories. Then, interprete the data to draw a conclusion

about the strength and weaknesses of the coursebook.

In each meeting they developed ideas, collected data, shared roles in groups, and carried out projects. The students are responsible to collect information, analyze and interpret data, and present them as the outcome of their learning (Simpson, 2011). This indicates that in evaluating English coursebook through project-based learning highlights the necessity to work well in a team. The activity is shown in the following figure.



Figure 4. Working in Group

In addition, the data from interview also revealed that by implementing Project Based Learning in Coursebook Evaluation class not only helped the students to understand the subject matter but also the students improved their language competence especially in reading and writing. It is relevant with the statement of Becket and Miller in Stoller (2006) that Project Based Learning provides opportunities for the natural integration of all four skills, reading, writing, listening and speaking.

In each meeting, the lecturer's carefully read the students' writing then provide appropriate responses. The lecturer wrote a comment at the students' writing which showed that they have been read. The students were frequently asked to elaborate on ideas they addressed when the meaning was not clear. Then, they need to revise their writing in the next meeting. Moreover, in the next meeting, when the students writing literature review and method the data showed the students' improvement in writing. They were able to write a good paraghraph. Since they were trained to analyze the information before selecting the appropriate information to be put in their paper. The activity is shown in the following figure.



Figure 5. Providing the feedback

Furthermore, the students' writing showed that the thinking skill developed. In the students' students' final paper showed that their thinking is more fluid, flexible and tangible is represented by the students' ability to interprete data and relate their findings with the theories from the expert. This might due to the impact of their efforts to discover information and ideas within the text by analyzing, synthesizing, then drawing inference, forming interpretation, and evaluating what they read to find the strengths and weaknesses of the English coursebook. This indicates that having students evaluating coursebook also teaches the students critical thinking skills such as analysis, inference interpretation, and synthesis knowledge. Thus, writing helps students integrate different sources of information and organize their thought (Dorn and Soffos, 2005: 47).

Moreover, the final paper found that most students' writing quality developed. This might due to the effect of the feedback that they received on their writing. This is in line with the statement of Ponpoon (2011) that Poject-based learning usually results in building learners' confidence, self-esteem, and autonomy as well as improving students' language skills, content learning, and cognitive abilities. Thus, in order to achieve considerable improvement students also require feedback on their writing work. Thus, lecturer's response to students' writing is important as can enhance students' motivation to write more and provides them with other points they can address (Taylor, 1991).

After the students finished in writing the paper of evaluating coursebook, they need to present their result of the project in teh form of video. Therefore, the last activity in implementing stage is creating the video. It is relevant with the statement of Williams (2017) that the implementation of project based learning will be easier if it is collaborated with media.

3. Presenting Stage

In presenting stage, the video was played in group presentation. The lecturer asked each group to explain the result of evaluating coursebook in front of the class. Then, the lecturer together with the students evaluated the video. The presentation activity is shown in the following figure.



The Challenges of the Implementation of Project Based Learning in Coursebook Evaluation Class

With regard to the aim of the research, this research also found some challenges in the implementation of teaching program. The challenges that were found in this research will be depicted in the following sections.

1. Challenges in finding the information

The data from interview revealed that some of respondents said that they had difficulties deal with finding the information and theories for completing the project. Thus, the challenge in this research mainly deals with students' reading skill. Consequently, it made students hard in developing ideas in their writing, as stated by student one below.

In completing the task, I need to read a lot since evaluating coursebook requires the students to analyze the theories, aspects, or concepts presented in that coursebook from a number of different perspectives. But, after I read and read again, I had difficulty in comprehending and finding the appropriate theories to be put in the paper.

(S1) (Interview, translated version)

The data of interview above showed that the students were not able to analyze, evaluate and synthesis information from a variety of sources and present their own justified interpretation. This learning process. Students not only had high comprehension in coursebook evaluation subject,

means that evaluating coursebook requires critical reading'as stated by Chaffee, et. al. (2002: 9) that critical reading means thinking critically about the information and its source. In other words, critical reading refers to critical thinking which is applied to the process of reading and writing (Chaffee, 2000).

2. Challenges in writing the paper

The second obstacle found in this study was students' weaknesses to master the components of writing itself, for example: lack of vocabulary, choices of words, and word forms. The data from interview revealed that most of the respondents said that their writing ability that make them difficult in creating project based learning. It is supported by the students' writing. There are many mistakes found in their writing such as grammatical error, misspelling, and incorrect diction.

3. Challenges in producing video.

They admitted that creating the project was still new to them. Therefore, they said that the most difficult part in creating the project was editting the video. This indicates that Insufficient competence in computer skills as the challenge for students.

CONCLUSION

The results of the investigation clearly show that the Project based Learning can be used effectively in Coursebook evaluation classroom in the following ways. First, the use of project-based learning in class is possible after providing the information that is needed for the project. In other words, the teachers should guide the students through sequence of preparation steps. Second, providing feedback to the students' project. lecturer's response to students' writing has developed students' writing skill. Thus, it is important as can enhance students' motivation to write more and provides them the feedback on their writing. Third, the implementation of project based learning will be easier if it is collaborated with media. In this study, the students were required to create video based on the students' result in evaluating English coursebook. This findings indicate that the use of project based learning is helpful and applicable for teaching Coursebook Evaluation.

Moreover, the findings also showed that Project based learning brought positive atmosphere to the but also they had a chance to practice their different skills such as writing, thinking,

researching, discussing, creating, etc. which are seen as crucial factors in learning a foreign language.

The last, it was revealed that there were three problems encountered by the students during the implementation of project based learning such as finding appropriate information, writing the paper and creating the video.

REFERENCES

- Apsari, Y. (2018). Reflective Reading Journal in Teaching Writing. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 4(2), 39-47.
- Apsari, Y., & Satriani, I. (2016). Students' perception Toward The Implementation of Digital Storytelling In Teaching Writing. *P2M STKIP Siliwangi*, 3(2), 97-102.
- Beare, K. (2011). How to choose a Coursebook and other classroom materials. [Online]. Available at: http://esl.about.com/cs/teachingresources/ht/coursebook.html
- Bell, S. (2010). Project-Based Learning for the 21st

Century: Skills for the Future. *The Clearing House*, 83(2), 39–43.

- Bender, W. N. (2012). *Project-based learning:* differentiating instruction for the 21st century. Thousand Oaks, Calif: Corwin Press.
- Bertin, B. (2003). *How to use coursebooks*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.univirtual.it
- Beyer, B.K. (1985). Critical thinking: What is it?, *Social Education*, 49, 270-276.
- Chaffee, J. (2000). *Thinking Critically*. Sixth Edition. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Chaffee, J., McMahon, C., Stout, B. (2002). Critical

Thinking Thoughtful Writing.
Second Edition. New York: Houghton
Mifflin Company.

- Chou, P. (2010). Advantages and disadvantages of ESL course books. [Online]. Available at: http://iteslj.org/Articles/Chou-CourseBooks.html.
- Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing your coursebook*. Oxford: Macmillan Publishers
- Dorn, L. J., and C. Soffos. (2005). *Teaching for Deep Comprehension: A Reading Workshop Approach*. Portland, ME:

Stenhouse.

- Facione, P. A. (2006). *Critical Thinking: What it is and why it counts*. Insight
 Assessment, California Academic Press.
- Fragoulis, L. (2009). Project-Based Learning in

Teaching of Englishas A Foreign Language in Greek Primary Schools: From Theory to practice. (A Journal). English Language Teaching. Vol. 2 September 2009

Frankel, J. & Wallen, N. (1993). How to Design and

Evaluate Research in Education. Singapore: McGraw-Hill, Inc.

Hafner, C. A., & Miller, L. (2011). Fostering learner

autonomy in English for science: A collaborative digital video project in a technological learning environment.

Language Learning & Technology, 15(3), 68-86.

Krauss, J.& Boss,S.

2013. Thinking Through Project-Based Learning: Guiding Deeper Inquiry. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin.

- Krajcik, J. S., Blumenfeld, P. C., Marx, R. W., & Soloway, E. (1994). A collaborative model for helping teachers learn projectbased instruction. *Elementary School journal*, *94*, 483-497.
- Maxwell, J. A. (1996). *Qualitative Data Analysis:* A

Source Book of New Methods. London: Beverly Hills.

- McGrath, I. (2002). *Materials evaluation and design for language teaching*. Great Britain: Edinburgh University Press.
- Molitor, L.L., & George, K.D. (1976). Development of a Test of Science Process Skills. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 13, 405-412.
- Moursund, D. (1999). Project-based learning using

information technology. Eugene, Oregon: International Society for Technology in Education.

Neo, M., & neo, T.-K. (2009). Engaging students in

multimedia-mediated constructivist learning—Students' perceptions. Educational technology & Society, 12(20, pp. 254—66.

Norris, S. P. & Ennis, R. H. (1989). *Evaluating Critical Thinking*. Victoria: Midwest

- Publication.
- Nunan, D. (1992). Research Methods in Language Learning. United State of America: Learning. Boston: Heinle & Heinle Publisher.
- Poonpon, Kornwipa. (2011). Enhancing English Skill through Project Based Learning. The English Teacher Vol. XL: 1-
 - 10 Journal. (pp. 1-10).
- Richards, J.C. (2001). Curriculum Development in Language Teaching. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Savery, John R. (2006). Overview of problem based
 - learning: Definitions and Distinctions.Interdisciplinary Journal of problem-based learning; Vol. 1: Iss. 1, Article 3
- Silverman, David. (2005). *Doing Qualitative Research*. London: SAGE Publication
 Ltd.
- Simpson, J. (2011). Integrating project-based learning in an English language tourism classroom in a Thai university institution. Doctoral Thesis,

 Australian Catholic UniversityStoller,
- Stoller, F. (2006) Establishing a Theoretical Foundation for Project-based Learning in Continuum International Publishing Group.

- Cambridge University Press. Nunan, D. (1999). *Second Language Teaching and*
- Second and Foreign Language Contexts Reinders, H., & White, C. (2011). Learner authonomy and new learning environments. Language Learning & Technology, 15(3), 1-3.
- Richards J. C. & Renandya W. A. (eds.).

 Methodology in language teaching: An anthology of current practice (pp. 107-120)

 .Cambridge: Cambridge
 University Press.
- Spendlove, D. (2008), "Creativity in education: a review, Design and Tech",. Edu.: An International Journal, 10(2), 9-18.
- Thomas, J., Michaelson, A. and Mergendoller, J. (2002). *Project-based learning: A handbook for middle and high school teachers*. Novato, CA: The Buc Institute for Education.
- Tomlinson, B. (2008) English Language Learning Material: A Critical Review.London:
- Williams, S. (2017). Investigating the Allocation and Corroboration Of Individual for Project-Based Learning. Student in Educational Evaluation, 53: 1-9.