

THE SUBTITLING STRATEGIES USED IN INDONESIAN FILM

Noni Agustina¹ and Joni²
noni@esaunggul.ac.id dan joni@esaunggul.ac.id

UNIVERSITAS ESA UNGGUL

ABSTRACT

The social phenomena can be represented through film providing images, soundtrack, voice-over, dance, and some art such as theatrical dan fine art. The Indonesian film played in XXI since 2017 must have English subtitling because the viewers nowadays are not only Indonesian people but also foreigner. The film subtitling is challenging because it is different from the other translation medium. A subtitler requires an appropriate translation strategy. Thus, this study aims to explore the subtitling strategies used in Indonesian film. The approach employed was qualitative with content analysis as a research design. The data used was English subtitling of 'A Man Called Ahok' film. The result showed that the dominant subtitling strategies used were repetition indicating the literal translation and addition strategy showing more information given. Respectively, transmutation and detraction strategies are also employed. Former indicated some changes in internal order such as lexical change, passive to active, etc. The latter showed deletion or condensation unnecessary or irrelevant information. Substitution strategy is the least used in subtitling which it indicates lack of paraphrasing. This study offers the theoretical and practical contribution on subtitling strategies especially from Bahasa Indonesia to English.

Keywords: Film, audiovisual translation, subtitling, translation strategies.

A. INTRODUCTION

Film is equipped by some technology consisting of images, soundtrack, voice-over, dance, and some art such as theatrical dan fine art. Delabastita (1989) dan Gottlieb (1998) in Mubenga (2010) urge that film has multisemiotic and multimodal. Mubenga also describes film as medium comprising verbal and non-verbal information in representing the information to the viewers. Thus, many generations are still keen on watching the film. The preliminary research conducted through interviewing one of marketing manager of XXI cinema Jakarta suggested that the Indonesian film played in XXI since 2017 must have English subtitling because many foreigners' viewers watch it in XXI cinema spreading in Indonesia. The subtitling is very important because it gives the viewers to grab the message or information of film especially for foreigners. They can follow the story well by comprehending it.

Subtiting which is part of audiovisual translation develops rapidly because of the advancement of technology (Munday, 2008). The internet growth contributes to the subtitling thriving because Mac's research finding (2009) showed that amateur subtitlers came up to

make the foreign movies subtitling and Japanese animation on internet (Tang, 2014). Moreover, the demand of Indonesian film subtitling also contributes to its enhancement.

Some previous studies undertaken by some researchers to scrutinise the subtitling. Tang (2014) investigated the subtitling strategies conducted by professional and amateur subtitlers concerning on the cultural representation of Kung-Fu Panda film. It is translated from English to Mandarin. Mollanazar, Nasrollahi, & Allameh (2017) also focused on the subtitling strategies on western films which were subtitled into Persian language. Nisaa, (2011) analysed the technique, method and ideology of film subtitling entitled Beckham Unwrapped. Kusumastuti (2011) investigated the technique used in dubbing and subtitling of Dora the Explorer film. Guillot (2010) studied the French thriller by exploring the English subtitles regarding the linguistic representation and culture. Mcclarty, (2014) explored the practice of creative subtitling. From the previous studies, English subtitling from Indonesian film is under researched. It is important to conduct the research by investigating the subtitling strategies in Indonesian film context.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Subtitling

Subtitle is texts written on the screen functioning to adding or substituting the soundtrack or live performance synchronized of the speech or voice-over uttered by the characters. It provides the benefits for the viewers. It gives the viewers' understanding on the story line (Mollanazar et al., 2017). Similarly, Bogucki (2016) urges that subtitling as part of audiovisual translation has purpose to message comprehension. Guillot (2010) suggests that subtitling which is used by foreign films does not only help the viewers to understand the story but also to explore the different culture. Caimi (2013) also sees that subtitling is also beneficial for the students as the viewers because it provides the linguistic and cultural comprehension in formal and informal settings. Price (1983) in Caimi (2013) investigates English Second Language students watch the subtitled TV program and result shows that their foreign language or culture acquisition is developed.

Bogucki (2016) urges that subtitling as part of audiovisual translation has some convention such as the subtitling template, constraints and easy effort for audience to process it. Karamitroglou in Bogucki (2016) explains some conventions in subtitling in detail. It must fit to the spatial parameter and layout which concern on the position of the screen, line numbers, characters per line, typeface and the color of background. It also focuses on the temporal parameter such as duration, leading-in and out time. The other elements should be considered by the subtitlers are punctuation, segmentation, omission guidelines, syntax alteration, the use of taboo or cultural aspects.

2. Strategies Subtitling

Some scholars have some terminologies in translation studies such as procedure, technique, method, operation and strategies. Chesterman (2005) in Mollanazar et al. (2017) recognizes them more or less same. In this study concerns on subtitling strategies. Strategies refers to 'a general way of translating in its basic problem-solving sense as a plan that is implemented in a given context and is cognitive procedure not linguistic' (Mollanazar et al., 2017).

The subtitling strategies refers to Debalastita's (1989) theory on ancient rhetoric which consists of repetitio, adiectio, detractio, transmutatio and substitutio. Repetitio strategy is called literal or imitation translation which reproduces or renders the identical manner. Adiectio strategy refers to the adding phrase, clause, sentence, expression, etc in order to give more important information. It does not mean alter the original or source language significantly. Detraction strategy is used to delete, decimate or condense the phrase, clause, sentence, expression, etc because of some consideration such as spatial and temporal limitation. Transmutatio strategy is used to render in some changes such as lexical changes, active to passtive or vice versa, negative to positive, etc. Substitutio strategy is used to modify or paraphrase which alter phrase, clause, sentence, expression from the source text. Substitutio strategy commonly occurs in idioms, proverbs or saying.

C. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research method used was content analysis with qualitative approach. The sources data was "A Man Called Ahok" film. It was played in November 2018 and in 4 days it reached five hundred thousand viewers. It was also watched by one million viewers. It was controversial film because some of Indonesian citizen thought that it brought political issues or political campaign but some of them considered it delivered the moral value such as empathy, honesty, hard-working, kindness, and so on. The data analysed were Indonesian voice-over and English subtitling.

The research procedures undertaken were visiting the production house and giving the consent form, watching the film, transcribing the Indonesian dan Kek voice-over, rewriting the English subtitle and some Indonesian subtitle if the character uttered Kek language, analysing the voice-over and subtitling by applying Delabastita's theories on ancient rhetoric (repetitio, adiectio, detractio, transmutatio and substitutio) and interpreting the findings and taking the conclusion.

D. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

From the interview undertaken to the producer, the English subtitling was made by a professional subtitler. It was found 961 data consisting of phrase, clause or sentences uttered by the characters. The subtitling strategies occurrence was different (table 1). The most dominant strategies used was repetitio. Its frequency was 632. It indicated that film used literal translation so the subtitler just imitated the source text to target text. It could be seen in the excerpts below:

[Ahok] Voice over: Papa
Subtitle: Papa

[Ahok] Voice over: Rumah sakit?
Subtitle: Hospital?

[Ahok] Voice over: Gratis
Subtitle: Free of charge

Then, the following strategy was adiectio which came up 112 times. The subtitler tended to add more information for the viewers so they comprehended the story. The underlined phrases '*the people*' and '*goals*' were the additional information given. For detailed instances were as follows:

[Ahok] Voice over: di kampung Gantung, Belitung Timur
*Subtitle: by **the people** of Gantung village in East Belitung.*

[Ahok] Voice over: Tapi kita bisa memilih mimpi kita
*Subtitle: However, we can determine our **goals** and dreams.*

The subtitler also applied transmutatio strategies but the frequency was not more than repetitio and adiectio, only 97. It occurred in pronoun changes and active-passive or vice versa. The excerpt was as follows:

[Ahok] Voice over: Urang-urang di kampungku mengenalnya sebagai Tauke
Subtitle: In the village he was also known as "Tauke"

The excerpt showed that there was change from active to passive. *Urang-urang* means people or villagers. People or villagers were subject which did an action 'knew' (active voice) but in subtitling, it was changed into passive voice.

Detractio strategy did not occur frequently which it was 73 times. The subtitler reduced or diminished some irrelevant or unnecessary information. It could be happened because of temporal and space restriction. The instances were as follows:

[Ahok] Voice over: Tentu kalua ajak Bapak, Ibu melakukan aksi seperti itu
Subtitle: ...if you continue.

[Civil servant staff] Voice over: Ini pak Kim Nam.Saye bawa dokumen. Pak Kim Nam harus tanda tangan
Subtitle: You need to sign the contract for the project.

The least strategy used was substitio. Its occurrence was 47 times. The less substitio use indicated lack of paraphrasing process in rendering the message. It was used mostly for rendering idioms, proverbs or saying. The strategy could be seen in the excerpt as follows:

[Ahok's Dad] Voice over: Oknum-oknum itu benar-benar merepotkan
Subtitle: Those people are getting on my nerves.

The findings were not fully similar to the research conducted by Mollanazar et al. (2017). They found that the dominant strategy used was repetitio (1495 occurrence). Respectively, the other strategies were detractio (601), transmutatio (416), adiectio (358) and substitio (301). They showed detraction was used after repetitio because they urged that temporal and spatial restriction influenced their way to render. On the other words, it fitted to the subtitling convention in terms of subtitling template Bogucki (2016).

This study did not only find English subtitling but also some Indonesian subtitling. It happened because some characters spoke Kek language (Mandarin language variation) and Belitung language. The Belitung language sounds similar to Bahasa Indonesia such as urang-urang (Belitung language) represented orang-orang (Bahasa Indonesia). It was found 31 utterances of Kek language. The instance was as follows:

[Civil servant staff] Voice over: Ni hao
 Subtitle: Apa kabar?
 How are you?

Table 1. Subtitling strategies of “A Man Called Ahok” film

Strategy	Frequency
Repetitio	632
Adiectio	112
Detractio	73
Transmutatio	97
Substitutio	47
Total	961

E. CONCLUSION

The subtitling which is part of audiovisual translation had different strategies. Based on Debalastita’s (1989) theory on ancient rhetoric, the subtitling strategies comprise repetitio, adiectio, detractio, transmutatio and substitutio. In ‘A Man Called Ahok’ film, the subtitling strategies have different occurrence. The most dominant ones are repetitio and adiectio. Then respectively the others are detractio, transmutatio and substitutio. The other finding shows Indonesian subtitling also comes up because some Kek language is spoken. Some characters not only speak Bahasa Indonesia but also Kek and Belitung language as their mother tongue. It is found 31 utterances of Kek language.

F. REFERENCES

- Bogucki, L. (2016). *Areas and methods of audiovisual translation research* (Second). Frankfurt: Peter Lang.
- Caimi, A. (2013). Subtitles and language learning. In Y. Gambier & L. Van Doorslaer (Eds.), *Handbook of translation studies*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Guillot, M. (2010). Film subtitles from a cross-cultural pragmatics perspective. *The Translator*, 16(1), 67–92. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.2010.10799294>
- Kusumastuti, F. (2011). *Analisis kontrastif subtitling dan dubbing dalam film kartun Dora The Explorer Seri Wish Upon A Star: Kajian teknik penerjemahan dan kualitas terjemahan*. Universitas Sebelas Maret.
- McClarty, R. (2014). In support of creative subtitling : Contemporary context and theoretical framework. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 22(4), 592–606. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2013.842258>

- Mollanazar, H., Nasrollahi, Z., & Allameh. (2017). Audiovisual translation – research and use. In M. Deckert (Ed.), *Audiovisual translation-research and use*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
- Mubenga, K. S. (2010). Investigating norms in interlingual subtitling : A systemic functional perspective. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 18(4), 251–274. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2010.482993>
- Munday, J. (2008). *Introducing translation studies: Theories and applications* (Second). Oxon: Rouledge.
- Nisaa, R. K. (2011). *Analisis teknik, metode dan ideologi penerjemahan subtitle film Beckham Unwrapped dan dampaknya pada kualitas terjemahan*. Universitas Sebelas Maret.
- Tang, J. (2014). Translating Kung Fu Panda’s kung fu-related elements: Cultural representation in dubbing and subtitling. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 22(3), 437–456. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2013.864686>