The Effect Of The Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition Model Assisted Video Media On Reading Comprehension And Critical Thinking

Arifin Ahmad[1], Bachrudin Mustafa[2], Dadang Sunendar[3], Ryan Septian[4]

[1]Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia
[2]Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia
[3]Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia
[4]Universitas Pasundan, Indonesia

[1]arifinahmad@upi.edu, [2]dinmusthafa@upi.edu, [3]dadangsunendar@upi.edu,
[4]ryanseptian533@gmail.com

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to find out the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model assisted by video media on its effect on reading comprehension and critical thinking. With a hypothesis that has a significant effect on students' reading comprehension and critical thinking skills, this research departs from the low reading comprehension ability and critical thinking skills of students at SDN Cihanjawar 02. A quantitative method with a quasi-experimental method is the method used in this research. Meanwhile, the design used is a non-equivalent group by conducting a pretest and posttest. Management techniques are carried out using normality tests, homogeneity tests, t tests and effect sizes. With the results of this research data analysis, there is an influence arising from the use of the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model on the ability to read comprehension and critical thinking of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02 based on the results of the Independent Sample T test obtained a sig (2-taled) value of 0.025 < 0.05 for reading comprehension ability and 0.010 <0.05 which means H0 is rejected and Ha is accepted. With the influence seen from the effect size test of 0.54 for reading comprehension skills and 0.60 for critical thinking skills, it can be said that the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Compositon model assisted by video media has a moderate effect.

Keywords: CIRC, Reading Comprehension, Critical Thinking

INTRODUCTION

Entering the digitalization era of education, 21st century literacy skills that support learning must be possessed by the nation's next generation in supporting the success of an education. One of the subjects that is mandatory at the education level in increasing the competence of graduates in facing the challenges of the times, starting from the level of primary, secondary, to tertiary education, is Indonesian. These subjects cover several aspects, including reading, listening, writing and listening. All of these aspects have various ways, but are closely related to each other. The purpose of this Indonesian subject is none other than to improve students' abilities, with the hope that it can support success in understanding other subjects. Students must be able to meet the demands of the curriculum, namely having higher reading skills, namely the ability to read comprehension. The content of the lesson in a theme which then becomes one makes the gap between the lesson content less visible. So as a result the level of readability of students in understanding a text is needed to support understanding

of other lesson content. Henry Guntur Tarigan defines reading comprehension as a type of reading that will provide goals in understanding literary reading standards, critical reviews, written plays and fictional patterns (Laily, 2014, p. 53) Then according to Aladwan (2021, p. 610) reading ability Comprehension is a main point in reading where there is an active process for the reader to understand the contents of the writing as well as a thought process that can be used to understand what the reader reads . Meanwhile, according to McLaughlin and Allen in (Niliawati, Hermawan, and Riyadi, 2018, p. 26) states that the principles used in reading comprehension include, 1) Comprehension, namely a series of actions to reconstruct, 2) Proficiency in language, as a form of line The large part of a curriculum will support in influencing the development of understanding, 3) The professionalism of a teacher influences the results of a student's understanding in reading, 4) Students who are already good at reading will be seen from the use of methods for effectiveness in understanding reading texts, 5) Meaningfulness in the process reading is the key to understanding a reading text, 6) Students get the benefits of reading themselves along with changes in class levels which bring changes in reading texts that are increasingly interesting, 7) Mastery of vocabulary is one of the causes of understanding a student's reading, 8) One's participation in Reading will train students in understanding a text reading, 9) Reading methods can be trained by a teacher, 10) Variable assessments can provide information to teachers about students' reading comprehension abilities.

Another aspect of cognitive abilities related to reading comprehension skills and skills needed in the 21st century is critical thinking skills (Critcal Thinking). John Dewey stated that critical thinking skills are a person's way of thinking deeply in analyzing, looking for answers to problems, asking yourself, and finding information for yourself rather than directly believing what other people say (Septikasari & Frasandy, 2018, p. 110). . According to R Stobaugh stated that critical thinking is the ability to think at a high level about the problems faced in order to solve problems in the form of situation analysis, arguments, and making the correct conclusions (Azizah, M., Sulianto, J., & Cintang, N. 2018, p. 62). Furthermore, according to Yuan & Stapleton (2019, p. 4) critical thinking is related to asking questions, finding out possibilities, knowing opposing points of view, then evaluating a fact in solving a problem. In improving students' reading comprehension and critical thinking skills, it is necessary to have treatment that gives influence, one of which is the use of learning models and learning media. Furthermore, according to Hussein, et al, (2019, p. 96309) critical thinking is a high-order thinking skill that involves a systematic approach using an intense level of understanding of a

problem, reviewing relevant information, drawing conclusions, and providing a solution to be analyzed and evaluated . There are several factors that influence a person's critical thinking actions according to Robert Ennis in (Suciono, Rasto, and Rahman, 2020, p. 50) states that these factors include, 1) Elementary Clarification, this factor is related to students' abilities in terms of analyzing a fundamental questions which can then be explained by themselves so that students are able to focus on these questions which they then analyze. This factor is also related to the analysis related to the arguments that students will feel to get clarity from these arguments. 2) Basic Support, this factor is related to the ability of students to trust a source of information obtained where students will question the validity of the information obtained from the source so that they carry out an observation or analysis of that information. 3) Inerfing, this factor is related to students' abilities in drawing conclusions from the results of analysis or observation of the information or arguments obtained. 4) Advance Clarification, the ability of students to explain terms obtained from sources of information or arguments which then define them with further explanation abilities in their own language. 5) Strategies and tactics, this factor relates to a person's ability to carry out interactions and communications with other people so that the actions he will take are appropriate and do not injure others when criticism arises of the information that other people provide.

There are several student-centered learning models, one of which is the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) model, the CIRC model is a learning model developed from the cooperative model. The CIRC model according to Robert E. Slavin explains that this model is a learning model that is aimed at improving reading comprehension and writing skills, especially in high grades (Niliawati, Hermawan, & Riyadi, 2018, p. 25). Then according to Slavin that the CIRC learning model has advantages in learning including that, 1) this learning model is widely known because it can increase students' reading comprehension, 2) The learning will be student centered, 3) learning will be carried out in groups will bring a pleasant atmosphere and make students motivated, 4) it is hoped that by applying the model students can check each other's understanding of a reading, 5) by grouping students heterogeneously can help students who have low levels of understanding be helped, 6) encourage students to have an attitude of cooperation, critical thinking, and responsibility (Nirwana, Muhana, & Furaidah, 2017, p. 524).

Then Sastika explained that there are six phases in CIRC learning (Awatik, 2019, p. 60) including: 1) Orientrion Phase: in this phase the teacher's duty is to provide apperception and inform learning objectives. 2) Organizational Phase: in this phase the teacher has a role to

direct students to form study groups consisting of 4 heterogeneous people 3) Concept Introduction Phase: this stage is the most essential stage where the teacher explains and helps students to understand a concept through verbal or media that will be used . 4) Exploration Phase: this phase students are invited to explore the knowledge they already have with the new knowledge they have to then develop it in their respective discussion groups . 5) Publication Phase: this phase requires students to be able to communicate the results of their findings on a material to their other friends by presenting it in front of the class . 6) Reinforcement or Reflection Phase: this phase is the end of learning where the teacher has a role to provide reinforcement, and opportunities for students to reflect on the material that has been studied .

The characteristics of the CIRC model The CIRC model is famous for its increased linguistic skills in its application, the characteristics of the CIRC model in improving language skills are proven by previous research conducted by experts, according to Rusman (2018, p. 206) that the characteristics of the CIRC learning model include, 1) the formation of groups with the aim of understanding a discussion text, 2) each member in the group is required to be responsible for completing their assignments, 3) does not have a specific task, 4) in heterogeneous groups students have equal opportunities to achieve learning objectives, 5) because the form of a heterogeneous group makes each student must have the ability to adapt, 6) the learning contained in the CIRC model is usually related to language and students' reading or writing abilities. Furthermore, Kiah (2018, p. 4) states that this CIRC model has characteristics that can be used by teachers to introduce a concept, emphasizing exploration and application, so in this model students are expected to have the ability to express their ideas, and provide opportunities for students to in publishing his ideas about the contents of the reading. So thus the researcher concluded that the characteristics of this CIRC model have the ability to improve students' abilities in terms of language, the concept of a material, and an emphasis on students' exploratory abilities regarding a reading text. In addition to the use of learning models in the classroom, other supporting factors in learning include learning media that are appropriate to the teaching materials and student characteristics.

Learning media is one of the supporters in conveying messages in the teaching and learning process. Learning video media is an alternative learning media when students carry out online learning, and is an alternative media that can be digital-based in learning and becomes a new paradigm learning video media. Learning media is a supporting factor in the success of learning carried out by the teacher in the classroom, because learning media can be used as a means of conveying messages that the teacher wants to give when in the classroom.

Learning videos according to Arsyad (2014, p. 162) states that although there is no definite definition of multimedia, video is an image that can be projected onto a screen mechanically so as to give a feeling that feels real. Furthermore Daryanto (2013, p. 88) states that learning video media is a tool that combines media images with audio media continuously in a matter of time. The considerations used to strengthen this assumption are previous studies.

Previous research can be used as a basis for selecting the right CIRC model. In the research conducted by Yulia Rahmi and Ilham Marnola at Ganting 4 Elementary School with a 5th grade sample in 2011 entitled Improving Students' Reading Comprehension Ability Through the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Compotion Learning Model, the results showed that there was an increase in students' reading ability of 85.5% (Rahmi & Marnola, 2020, p. 670). Furthermore, research conducted by Ni Gusti Ayu Mirah Wariandari, and Maria Goreti Rini Kristiantari with research samples taken at SDN 5 Gianyar and SDN 7 Gianyar class 5 in 2019 which was entitled The Influence of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition Learning Model Assisted by Concept Maps on Ability Reading Comprehension was obtained by using the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition learning model with ttable with dk = 56 and a significance level of 5% so that tcount is 8.7619. So it can be said that this model can affect students' reading comprehension skills (Wirandari & Krititiantari 2020, p. 55). Furthermore, research conducted by Anggi Fitri, Firdaus, Juni Kardi, Yundri Akhyar, Zalisman, and Syahrir Ramdhan at SDN 13 Pekanbaru and SDN 40 Pekanbaru with a class 5 research sample in 2020 entitled The Effect of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition Learning Models on Skills Reading Comprehension of Elementary School Students obtained results by testing the hypothesis using the Two Way Annova test 0.000 <0.005 so that it can be concluded that the CIRC model is very significant in improving reading comprehension skills (Fitri, et al. 2021, p. 8). Furthermore, research conducted by Cindy Cindhana Brilliananda, Retno Winarni, and Muhammad Ismail Sriyanto at SDN Pajang II No. 171 with a class 4 research sample in 2020 entitled Improving Reading Comprehension Skills Through the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition Learning Model in Grade IV Elementary School Students, the results obtained were able to improve reading comprehension skills by 83.5% of the indicators set in the research that was obtained from 3 cycles of classroom action research (Brilliananda, Winarni & Sriyanto, 2021, p. 89). Furthermore, research conducted by Mega Amalia, Arie Rakhmat Riyadi, and Effy Mulyasari with a class 4 sample at one of the SD Sukajadi sub-districts in 2018 entitled Application of the CIRC Model to Improve Reading Comprehension Ability of Class V SD Students obtained 85.71% through

2 cycles conducted in class (Amalia, Riyadi, & Mulyasari, 2019, p. 26). Furthermore, research conducted by Ni Kadek Sudiarni and Made Sumantri at SDN 2 Kalibukbuk and SDN 2 Anturan with a class 5 sample in 2018 entitled The Effect of the CIRC Assisted Learning Model Portfolio Assessment on Reading Comprehension Skills obtained by testing the hypothesis using the t-test shows that tcount > ttable (tcount = 7.73 > ttable =1.99714), so it can be concluded that the CIRC model has a significant effect on reading comprehension ability (Sudiarni & Sumantri, 2019, p. 71). This research is meaningful in terms of variables where there are video learning media supports in the application of the CIRC model. With a temporary assumption or hypothesis that the CIRC model assisted by video media can improve students' reading comprehension and critical thinking skills. Based on this description, the expected objective of this study is to determine the effect of the CIRC model assisted by video media on reading comprehension and critical thinking skills in elementary schools.

METHOD

Research Approach

The quantitative approach is a research centered on processing data received through existing figures obtained directly from field research. According to Sugiyono (2015, p. 13) that the quantitative approach is a research approach that uses statistics to analyze data in the form of numbers. The quantitative approach used in this research is experimental research

So in this case the researcher will carry out research based on the principles of quantitative research. By collecting primary data through pretest and posttest instruments on grade 5 students at SDN Cihanjawar 02, Pasirjambu sub-district, so that the data obtained is based on the actual situation.

Research design

According to Sukamdinata, "research is defined as a process of collecting and analyzing data that is carried out systematically and logically to achieve certain goals" in (Sugiyono, 2017, p. 5). In research, of course there must be a supporting instrument, so that there are no difficulties when going into the field. This research will be based on the principles of quantitative research. By collecting primary data through pretest and posttest instruments on grade 5 students at SDN Cihanjawar 02, Pasirjambu District, Bandung Regency, so that the data obtained is based on the actual situation. The quasi-experimental form in this study was a nonequivalent control group design. According to Sugiyono (2015, p. 114) states that there are two quasi-experimental studies namely Time-Series-Design and Nonequlavent Control Group Design, in this case the researcher prefers nonequlavent control group design because in this study the subject form of the research was not selected . randomly, and this research will not take long because of the implementation of the pretest and posttest which are mostly due to looking for the consistency of the research subject during the learning process.

Table 1 Design Nonequivalent Control Group Design

Group	Pretest	Treatment	Posttest
Experiment	O	X	O
Control	O		O

So it is hoped that the effect of the CIRC model assisted by video media will be known on students' reading comprehension and critical thinking skills with the help of the instruments to be used

Research subject

The subject of this study was centered on samples taken at SDN Cihanjawar 02, Pasirjambu District, Bandung Regency, the population at SDN Cihanjawar 02 was 310 students with a total study group of 12 classes. The students who were used as the subject of this study were 63 students, taken from two study groups, namely VA class and VB class, for VA class there were 31 students while for VB class there were 32 students.

Data analysis

The data analysis technique used in this study is the t test, namely the independent sample t test , which means by looking at the average resulting from the experimental class posttest data and the control class posttest. The significance level used is 5%. So if the data obtained has a tcount <ttable, then there is no effect, and if the tcount > ttable, then there is an influence. In addition to using the t test, this study also uses the effect size test .

effect size test is used to measure the level of impact that arises from the treatment in research. According to White, Redford, and James (2019, p. 1) states that effect size is a measure of the magnitude of a relationship or difference or effect of one variable on another variable. The effect size formula can be written as follows,

$$\delta = \frac{Ye - Yc}{Sc}$$

Information

δ : Effect Size

Ye : Average Score of Experimental Class

Yc : Average Value of Control Class

Sc : Standard Deviation of Control Class

Table 2 Interpretation of Effect Size

Effect Size value	Interpretation
0-0.20	Weak effect
0.21-0.50	Enough effect
0.51-1.00	Medium effect
>1.00	Strong effect

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

The data analysis technique used in this study is the independent t test and effect size to be able to determine the effect of the CIRC learning model assisted by video media on reading comprehension skills. The data used in the independent t test and effect size tests use the main data that comes from the pretest and posttest. Data analysis was assisted by the SPSS 25 statistical application for testing prerequisites and hypotheses.

The first step taken in this study was to analyze the data with prerequisite tests including the normality test and data homogeneity test. Based on the data normality test carried out with the Shapiro Wilk data normality test, the data results obtained were normally distributed, and based on the data homogeneity test it was found that the data was homogeneous or in the same class. After the prerequisite test is fulfilled, then the test is carried out to answer the research hypothesis.

Based on the results of the analysis of the independent sample t test hypothesis test, it can be seen that the t-count value is 2.308 > 2.042 and has a significance value of 0.025 <0.05 for reading comprehension ability and a t-count value of 2.645 > 2.042 and has a significance value of 0.010 <0.05 for critical thinking skills. Thus, based on the results of the independent sample t test, the CIRC learning model assisted by video media has an effect on the reading comprehension and critical thinking skills of elementary school students in grade V.

Reading Comprehension Ability

$$\delta = \frac{Ye - Yc}{Sc}$$
$$\delta = \frac{67,3 - 57,7}{17,607}$$
$$\delta = \frac{9,6}{17,607}$$
$$\delta = 0,54$$

Critical Thinking Skills

$$\delta = \frac{Ye - Yc}{Sc}$$
$$\delta = \frac{68,3 - 57,9}{17,067}$$
$$\delta = \frac{9,6}{17,067}$$
$$\delta = 0,60$$

Then based on the interpretation value of the effect size test that is 0.54 for reading comprehension skills and 0.60 for moderate critical thinking skills (moderate effect) . So according to the predetermined decision making it can be concluded that Ha is accepted and H 0 is rejected. Thus the researcher interprets that there is a significant influence resulting from the application of the CIRC model assisted by video media on students' reading comprehension skills and critical thinking skills.

Discussion

Based on the results of the independent sample t test hypothesis test, it is known that the significance value of the experimental class for reading comprehension ability is 0.025 <0.05 so it can be concluded that the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model assisted by video media has an effect on the reading comprehension ability of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02. After going through independent test sample t test then the test is continued with an effect size test to find out the impact resulting from using the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model assisted by video media has an effect on the reading comprehension ability of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02.

Effect size test is to illustrate that there is a significant impact or influence, based on the data obtained the test value of the effect size is 0.54 if interpreted from the data, it can be said that there is a moderate effect . Based on these data, it can be concluded that the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model assisted by video media has an effect on the reading comprehension ability of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02 and has a moderate impact.

Furthermore, based on the results of the independent sample t test hypothesis test, it is known that the significance value of the experimental class for reading comprehension ability is 0.010 <0.05 so it can be concluded that the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model assisted by video media has an effect on the critical thinking skills of fifth

grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02. After through an independent test sample t test then the test is continued with an effect size test to find out the impact resulting from the use of the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model assisted by video media has an effect on the critical thinking skills of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02.

Effect size test is to illustrate that there is a significant impact or influence, based on the data obtained the test value of the effect size is 0.60 if interpreted from the data, it can be said that there is a moderate effect. Based on these data, it can be concluded that the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition model assisted by video media has an effect on the critical thinking skills of class V students at SDN Cihanjawar 02 and has a moderate impact. In accordance with previous studies which stated that the CIRC model can affect students' reading comprehension and critical thinking skills.

Based on the results of this study, it can be compared with previous studies that the CIRC learning model assisted by video media can improve comprehension skills, but there is a significant difference with previous research that the CIRC learning model that there is a slight reduction in the level of significance of research conducted without the use of learning video media. this can be influenced by the characteristics of students who are given treatment. However, based on the results of this study, it can be related to the constructivism theory that the CIRC model is able to build a concept or in-depth understanding by building the knowledge possessed by a student through learning that is given in groups and directly practicing the concepts given by the previous teacher in work group. This is in line with the assumption put forward by Suparlan (2019, p. 83) that someone will find it easier to apply a concept or build a knowledge they have with reciprocity.

There are several questions after this research that can be used as a reference in further research, 1) What if the CIRC model is assisted by e-book presentation learning media?, 2) Will the CIRC model assisted by video media still have an impact on low grade students?, 3) What is the relationship between reading comprehension and critical thinking skills?

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the data analysis that has been carried out about the effect of the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition learning model assisted by video media on the ability to read comprehension and critical thinking, it can be concluded based on the formulation of the research problem as follows,

Based on the results of the analysis using the independent parametric test sample t test and the effect size test, it was found that the students' reading comprehension ability increased

by looking at a significance value of 0.025 <0.05, it can be concluded that the CIRC model assisted by video media has a positive influence on reading comprehension ability. Furthermore, with a value of 0.54 through the effect size test, which means it has a moderate effect on the reading comprehension ability of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02, Pasirjambu District, Bandung Regency.

The CIRC model assisted by video media also has a significant effect on the critical thinking skills of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02, Pasirjmbu District, Bandung Regency. This conclusion is based on the results of the independent sample t test, namely the effect size test on the pretest and posttest data of the experimental class and control class with a significance value of 0.010 <0.05, it can be concluded that the CIRC model assisted by video media has a positive influence on critical thinking skills. Furthermore, with a value of 0.60 for testing the effect size analysis, which means it has a moderate effect on the critical thinking skills of fifth grade students at SDN Cihanjawar 02, Pasirjambu District, Bandung Regency.

There are several suggestions that can be given from the results of this study including, the process of implementing the CIRC model requires patience and facilitates each student to be able to actively participate in the discussion group because the success of the increase will depend on the effectiveness of the discussion group, then the formation of heterogeneous groups will provide opportunities for students who are less able to be able to find out through experience with more capable students, there are still many learning media that can be used in the CIRC model learning process, it is very possible if the use of other learning media will have a more significant effect.

REFERENCES

Aladwan, Y, M, A. (2022). Learning Reading Comprehension Via ClassDojo: An Exploration of Jordanian EFL Students' Attitudes. IUG Journal Education and Psychological Sciences. 20 (2): 610-621

Amalia, M., Riyadi A,R & Mulyasari, E. (2019). Penerapan Model CIRC Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa Kelas V SD. Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar. 4 (1): 15-28

Arsyad, A (2014). Media Pembelajaran. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada

Awatik. (2019). Pembelajaran Dengan Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) Dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Menemukan Pokok Pikiran. Trapsial: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar. 1 (2): 56-68

Azizah, M., Sulianto, J., & Cintang, N. (2018). Analisis Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Siswa Sekolah Dasar Pada Pembelajaran Matematika Kurikulum 2013. Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan. 35 (1):61-69

Brilliananda. C.C., Winarni, R., & Sriyanto, M,I. (2021). Peningkatan Keterampilan Membaca Pemahaman Melalui Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition Pada Peserta Didik Kelas IV Sekolah Dasar. Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmiah. 7 (2): 86-91

Fitri, A., dkk. (2021). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition Terhadap Keterampilan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa Sekolah Dasar. Jurnal Pendidikan. 12 (1): 1-12

Daryanto. (2013). Media Pembelajaran (Peranan Sangat Penting Dalam Mencapai Tujuan Pembelajaran. Yogyakarta: Gava Media

Hussein, M, H., dkk. (2019). A Digital Game-Based Learning Method To Improve Students' Critical Thinking Skills In Elementary Science. IEEE Access. 7: 96309-96318

Kiah. (2018). Upaya Meningkatan Kemampuan Siswa Dalam Mendeskripsikan Perkembangan Kependudukan Melalui Penggunaan Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (Circ). Jurnal Wahana Pendidikan. 5 (1): 1-11

Laily, I. F. (2014). Hubungan Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman dengan Kemampuan Memahami Soal Cerita Matematika Sekolah Dasar. Eduma Tadris Matematika. 3 (1): 52-62

Niliawati, L., Hermawan, R., & Riyadi, A, R. (2018). Penerapan Metode Circ (Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition) Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa Kelas IV. Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar. 3 (1): 23-34.

Nirwana, Y.D., Muhana G., & Furaidah. (2017). Pembelajaran Model Cooperative Integrated Reading Composition (CIRC) Untuk Membantu Siswa SD Memahami Bacaan. Transformasi Pendidikan Abad 21. 4 (49): 521-525

Rahmi, Y., & Marnola, I. (2020). Peningkatan Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman Siswa Melalui Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading And Compotion (Circ). Jurnal Basicedu. 4 (3): 662-672

Rusman. (2018). Model-Model Pembelajaran: Mengembangkan Profesionalisme Guru. Jakarta: Rajawali Press

Septikasari, R., & Frasandy, R.A. (2018). Keterampilan 4C Abad 21 Dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Dasar. Jurnal Tarbiyah Al-Awlad. 8 (2): 112-122

Suciono, W., Rasto, & Ahman, E. (2020). Analisis Faktor-Faktor yang Mempengaruhi Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Siswa dalam Pembelajaran Ekonomi Era Revolusi 4.0. Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial. 17 (1): 48-56

Sudarni, N, K., & Sumantri. (2019). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Circ Berbantuan Penilaian Portofolio Terhadap Keterampilan Membaca Pemahaman. Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Profesi Guru. 2 (1): 71-81

Sugiyono. (2015). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta

Sugiyono. (2017). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta

Suparlan. (2019). Teori Kontruktivisme Dalam Pembelajaran. Islamka: Jurnal Keislaman dan Ilmu Pendidikan. 1 (2): 79-88

White, P., Redford, P, C., & Macdonald, J. (2019) Cohen's d for two independent sample, Qualitative and Quantitative Research Methods Project, University of the West of England. UWE, Quantitative Research Methods Project: 1-4

Wirandari, N. G. A. M., & Kristiantari, M. G. R. (2020). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition Berbantuan Peta Konsep Terhadap Kemampuan Membaca Pemahaman. Jurnal Pedagogi Dan Pembelajaran. 3(1): 55-63

Yuan, R., & Stapleton, P. (2019). Student Teachers' Perceptions Of Critical Thinking And Its Teaching. Oxford University Press. 74 (1): 1-9.