

# Addressing educational disparities: the role of policy in expanding early childhood education access in 3T areas

Putri Indah Sari<sup>1\*</sup>, Rudiyanto<sup>2</sup>, Mubiar Agustin<sup>3</sup> <sup>1</sup>Univeritas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia <sup>2</sup>Univeritas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia <sup>3</sup>Univeritas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia

#### **Article Info**

#### Article history:

Received September 04, 2024 Revised September 22, 2024 Accepted October 29, 2024

#### Keywords:

Policy, Early childhood, Acces Area

#### Abstract

Poor health can hinder a child"s overall development. Inadequate stimulation at home: Many children do not receive enough cognitive stimulation and emotional support in their early years, which are critical for brain growth and learning. The research method used in this article is a literature study by collecting books, journal articles, research reports, and other sources relevant to the topic of The Role of Policy in Building Equitable Access to Early Childhood Education. There are many ways that the budget for ECE operations can be used to improve early childhood education, such as: 1) Improved Facilities and Infrastructure: With sufficient budget, ECE institutions can repair and upgrade their physical facilities that support learning, such as libraries, playgrounds, and classrooms. 2) Improving the Quality of Educators: To improve the quality of teaching and learning in ECE, an adequate budget can be used for training and development of ECE teachers to meet teacher competency standards. This will have a positive impact on the quality of teaching and learning in ECE. 3) Curriculum Development and Learning 4) Procurement of Teaching Materials and Learning Media: You can use the budget to purchase high-quality teaching materials and learning media It is important that action is taken by the government to address disparities in access to education in disadvantaged, frontier and outermost (3T) areas

This is an open access article under the <u>CC BY-SA</u> license.



#### **Corresponding Author:**

Name Author: Putri Indah Sari Affiliation, Country: Univeritas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia Email Author: <u>putriindahsari655@upi.edu</u>



# INTRODUCTION

One of the most fundamental human rights is the right to education. To fulfill this right, governments must ensure that equal, high-quality and free education is available to everyone. Education not only aims to create a competent workforce, but also develops human personality, such as understanding, tolerance, friendship and peace. In Indonesia, as a vast archipelago with high geographical diversity, the big challenge in equalizing access to education becomes more complex, especially in the disadvantaged, frontier and outermost (3T) areas. Access to quality education in 3T areas is often difficult due to limited infrastructure, difficult access, and low mobility to more developed urban areas (Ulfiaturrohmah et al., 2021).

The decentralization policy implemented in Indonesia's governance adds to the complexity of this problem. While decentralization aims to bring services closer to the people, the lack of coordination between sectors and levels of government can affect the implementation of early childhood education policies. Poorly coordinated education policies can hinder the achievement of equitable access and adequate quality of education, especially in 3T areas (Neuman & Okeng'o, 2019).

Other factors that affect early childhood development in these areas include poverty, poor nutrition and limited access to quality health services. Poverty is a major barrier as it affects access to nutritious food, health services, and early stimulation and learning opportunities. Malnutrition can cause long-term impacts on children's physical and cognitive development, while poor health and lack of stimulation at home exacerbate developmental delays (Neuman & Okeng'o, 2019). In addition, unsafe environments and lack of access to quality early childhood education also impact children's school readiness and future academic success.

In the context of education policy, there is a shift in orientation from the progressive goal of education, which is to form critically thinking and socially responsible individuals, to a focus on creating a skilled workforce for an information-based economy. This focus on economic outcomes has the potential to obscure the broader goals of education, such as promoting social responsibility and critical thinking (Deuchar, 2024).

The Indonesian government has designed various policies to support early childhood education (ECE), ranging from the legislative system to technical implementation. Law No. 20/2003 on the National Education System includes provisions for all levels of education, including early childhood education. Article 28 of this law regulates three types of education services: formal, non-formal and informal. Early childhood education in formal education is provided through kindergarten (TK) or Raudatul Athfal (RA), while in non-formal education it is provided by playgroups, daycare centers (TPA), or other forms.

To implement the law, the government also issued several supporting regulations, such as Government Regulation No 19 of 2005 on National Education Standards and Law No 14 of 2005 on Teachers and Lecturers. These regulations stipulate the academic qualification and competency requirements for PAUD educators, where PAUD teachers must have a minimum of a D-IV or S1 qualification and adequate competencies as educators. The Ministry of Education and Culture's strategy focuses on three policy pillars: expanding access, improving quality, and strengthening education governance (Istiqomah, 2017).

Although various policies have been made, major challenges still exist in their implementation, especially in the 3T areas. Lack of accessibility, limited infrastructure and socio-economic challenges exacerbate disparities in accessing quality early childhood education. Therefore, more integrated and sustained efforts are needed from the government, communities and other stakeholders to ensure that all children in Indonesia, including those in the 3T areas, get their right to quality education.

Although the government has adopted a comprehensive education policy to improve access and quality of ECD in Indonesia, there are still significant gaps in implementation, particularly in the 3Ts. Previous research has identified structural challenges such as poverty, lack of access to nutrition and health, and unsafe environments as factors affecting early childhood development (Neuman, 2019). However, there is a lack of in-depth empirical research on the specific impact of decentralized education governance on ECD policy implementation in 3T areas. Furthermore, few studies have focused on how a more progressive approach to education policy that emphasizes social responsibility and critical thinking can be effectively implemented in infrastructure-limited areas such as the 3Ts. This creates a significant research gap, particularly in relation to



efforts to integrate more responsive and inclusive education policies to address the challenges faced by children in these disadvantaged areas.

## **METHOD**

This research utilizes the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) method, which is a structured approach to identify, evaluate and interpret all relevant research related to a particular topic. In this context, the research focuses on the role of policy in building equal access to early childhood education (ECD). Through this method, the research collects sources of various types such as books, journal articles, research reports, and other relevant sources to gain a comprehensive understanding of the topic (Waruwu, 2023).

This type of research is qualitative research. The Systematic Literature Review focuses on collecting and analyzing published scholarly literature sources, with the aim of identifying trends, key findings, and research gaps on the topic of the role of policy in expanding equal access to early childhood education. This research does not conduct experiments or direct primary data collection, but rather reviews existing studies. The approach used in this research is desk-based research, where data is obtained through searching, collecting and analyzing published literature. The researcher collected secondary sources from various publications relevant to the topic of the role of policy in expanding equal access to early childhood education, including sources that discuss education policy in disadvantaged, frontier and outermost (3T) areas. This approach aims to provide an overview of the current state of the research and how public policy has been implemented in the context of early childhood education.

The research subjects in this study are scientific works that are relevant to the topic of the role of policy in building equal access to early childhood education. The subject literature consists of:

- 1. Books and Monographs: A search was conducted for books related to early childhood education and education policy. This included academic books, monographs and publications from educational institutions relevant to the topic of equal access to ECD.
- 2. Journal Articles: Articles from academic journals that address topics related to education policy, equal access to ECD, and policy implementation in 3T areas. Preferably, articles that have gone through a peer-review process so that they have high validity and credibility
- 3. Research Report: Reports on research conducted by government agencies, NGOs, and international organizations related to early childhood education policy implementation in Indonesia and 3T areas.

The data collection techniques in this study were carried out through a systematic procedure that included several stages:

- 1. Literature Identification: A literature search was conducted through academic databases such as Google Scholar, JSTOR, Scopus, and ERIC. The keywords used included "early childhood education policy," "equitable access," "3T areas," "education policy in Indonesia," and other relevant terms. In addition, policy reports and books published by education organizations such as UNESCO, the World Bank, and the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture were searched.
- 2. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria: Inclusion criteria included publications relevant to the topic of the role of policy in expanding access to ECD, publications published within the last 10 years, and articles that underwent a peer-review process. Exclusion criteria include publications that are irrelevant, not focused on ECD policy, or published more than 10 years ago unless considered a major influence in the field.
- 3. Screening and Selection: After the initial identification, the researcher will conduct an initial selection of relevant articles based on the abstract, keywords, and research objectives. After that, further screening is done to ensure suitability to the research topic.

Data analysis was conducted using the thematic analysis method. This process involved several stages: The researcher collected key data from selected sources, including information on the main topic, methodology

Ciliwan unas IURNAL PROGRAM STUDI PENDIDIKAN STKIP SILWANGI BANDUNG

Volume. 10, Number. 2, October 2024

used, research findings, and policy recommendations. The collected data was categorized based on relevant themes, such as education policy, access to ECD in 3T areas, and challenges in policy implementation. Each theme was further analyzed to identify trends, gaps and key contributions to the literature. Data Synthesis: At this stage, the categorized data is integrated to provide an overview of the current state of the research. The researcher will draw conclusions that reflect the role of policy in expanding equitable access to ECE in the 3T areas, as well as identify any remaining research gaps.

# **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION** Result

Name	years	Title	Result
Monica R. Brown,	2024	Identifying Policy Flaws:	The article states that the enactment of
Monique Matute-		Addressing Educational	equitable ECE policies can result in
Chavarria,		Inequities in Early Childhood	significant gains for black children. By
Pricella Morris		Education for Young Black	correcting existing inequities, these
(Brown et al.,		Children	policies have the potential to improve
2024)			educational outcomes, promote social
			inclusion and enhance the overall well-
			being of children from marginalized
			backgrounds. Recommendations for
			Stakeholders: This article articulates
			pragmatic recommendations for diverse
			stakeholders, including educators, black
X7 XX	2015		families, and policy makers
Xiumin Hong,	2015	The way to early childhood	This study provides a detailed analysis of
Peng Liu, Qun Ma & Xin Luo		education equity-policies to tackle the urban-rural	the significant inequities in early
(Hong et al., 2015)		disparities in China	childhood education (ECE) in China, especially between urban and rural areas.
(Holig et al., 2013)		dispanties in China	The research identifies three main
			aspects of disparity: opportunities,
			processes and outcomes. Rural children
			face limited access to educational
			opportunities compared to their urban
			counterparts, which is exacerbated by a
			lack of resources such as qualified
			teachers, adequate school facilities and
			teaching materials. The article highlights
			that the quality of ECE in rural areas lags
			significantly behind urban areas, leading
			to inequitable educational outcomes.
			The article concludes that significant
			disparities remain in educational
			opportunities, resources and teacher
			qualifications between urban and rural
			areas.

# Table. Data Source



Volume. 10, Number. 2, October 2024

Laura Emily Brooks,Janeli Kotzé,Colin Almeleh &Enganas Senona (Brooks et al., 2022)	2022	Assessing the policy options for the public provisioning of early childhood development programmes.	the article emphasizes the urgent need for policy reforms in the South African ECD sector to bridge the access gap and fulfill the commitment to ECD as a universal right. A mixed-model approach is presented as a viable solution to improve the reach and quality of ECD programs, ultimately contributing to better outcomes for children and addressing the broader social issues of inequality and poverty.
Hyunwoo Yang, Nirmala Rao, Emma Pearson (Yang et al., 2024)	2024	Inequality in access to early childhood care and education programs among 3- to 4-year- olds: Trends and variations across low- and middle- income countries	This article presents significant findings on the relationship between enrollment rates in early childhood care and education (ECCE) and inequalities in access in low- and middle-income countries. The study analyzes enrollment data from 30 countries, revealing that higher national enrollment rates in ECCE are correlated with lower inequalities in access. Among the 20 countries that experienced significant increases in ECCE enrollment over time, six showed significant reductions in inequalities in access, while 13 countries showed no substantial change. The study identifies four key factors that contribute to income-related inequalities in ECCE access: family wealth, maternal education, gender, and urbanicity. These factors were found to influence the likelihood of ECCE use among children.
Travis Wright (Wright, 2011)	2011	Countering the Politics of Class, Race, Gender, and Geography in Early Childhood Education	significant disparities in access to high- quality early childhood education (ECE) reflect broader social inequities. It highlights that many young children and their families are unable to benefit from the promise of ECE due to systemic barriers related to class, race, gender, and geography. The analysis shows that the lack of universal, publicly funded preschool options perpetuates these inequities, resulting in low-income children often being served in low- quality settings while their more affluent peers access higher-quality programs. The findings suggest that economic segregation in preschool settings exacerbates these challenges, as children



Volume. 10, Number. 2, October 2024

from low-income backgrounds often
attend schools with inadequate resources
and supports. This segregation limits
their developmental opportunities and
reinforces existing disparities in
educational outcomes.

Addressing education disparities in early childhood education (ECE) requires a multifaceted approach, especially in 3T areas. Policies play an important role in expanding access to ECE and ensuring equitable opportunities. Many existing ECE policies have weaknesses, especially for marginalized groups, so recommendations are needed to prioritize equity and increase stakeholder engagement (Brown et al., 2024). In China, there are significant disparities between urban and rural ECE access, with challenges in achieving equitable outcomes despite policies to optimize resources (Hong et al., 2015). In South Africa, only 35% of children aged zero to five access ECD programs, with suggestions for a mixed model of public provision. In addition, structural barriers and attitudes that perpetuate inequities in ECE access require policy reforms that directly address these issues, including advocacy for publicly funded universal preschool (Brooks et al., 2022), (Wright, 2011). While policy reforms can bring about change, systemic problems may remain, so evaluation and adaptation of strategies are needed to ensure equitable access to ECE for all children.

Equity in ECD ensures that all children and families have access to quality ECD programs and services, regardless of their socioeconomic status or background. It also means making these programs easily accessible, especially for those who are most disadvantaged. Britto et al., (2011) The government's role in ensuring equality in Early Childhood Education (ECED) is critical to achieving the development goal of inclusive and equitable education. Here are some of the key roles of government in promoting equity in ECD: First Public Policy: Government is responsible for designing and implementing public policies that support equitable access to and quality of ECD for all children. These policies should ensure that all children have equal opportunities for high-quality education. Second Funding: The government must provide sufficient funding to support equitable and quality ECD programs. This includes investments in infrastructure, teacher training, curriculum development, and other supporting resources needed to create an inclusive learning environment for all children. Third Monitoring and Evaluation: The government should monitor and assess ECD programs to ensure quality standards are met and that services are not discriminatory. This evaluation is important to ensure that all children get the best benefits from ECD programs. Fourth, collaboration with related parties: To ensure that ECD programs meet the needs and diversity of children in the community, the government should collaborate with educational institutions, communities, and non-governmental organizations. By working together, efforts to achieve equity in early childhood education can be strengthened (Britto et al., 2011);(Neuman & Okeng'o, 2019);(Semaun, 2019).

Government policies are critical to addressing the issue of limited access to education. Some examples of government policies addressing this issue include: Tuition Fee Subsidy Policy: The government can establish a policy that allows subsidizing tuition fees to help underprivileged families reduce their expenses so that children can still go to school free of charge. Education Infrastructure Policy: This policy involves expanding access to education by building and improving education infrastructure such as schools, classrooms and other supporting facilities in remote areas. Education Transportation Policy: The government can make special rules to facilitate children's access to school, especially in remote areas (Neuman & Okeng'o, 2019);(Sulasmi et al., 2023).

The committee's stakeholders, including educational researchers, ECE program representatives, nongovernmental organizations, early childhood education practitioners, and ECE students, play a significant part in the policy-making process. The early childhood teacher education framework's direction and content are mostly determined by the policy. It also affects how decisions are made, how schools are set up, and how responsibilities are distributed between the nationally recognized norms created by ECE professionals and the legally controlled framework (Aslanian, 2020). Comparison of early childhood education access in Bangladesh, China, India and Myanmar with programs such as community-based early childhood development



Volume. 10, Number. 2, October 2024

programs, Bangladesh has made progress in expanding early childhood education access. However, there are still difficulties in reaching rural and marginalized communities, leading to differences in access based on socioeconomic factors. China has invested a large amount of money in early childhood education, with a special emphasis on improving preschool education in urban areas. There are differences between urban and rural areas, and rural areas face problems getting good early childhood education. The Indian government's Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) program has improved access to early childhood education. Socio-economic status, gender and geographical location still cause disparities, and marginalized and rural communities face difficulties in accessing it. Myanmar has tried to improve access to early childhood education but it is still difficult to reach remote and conflict-affected areas. Differences still exist between urban and rural areas, and in rural areas there is limited access to high-quality early childhood education (Rao et al., 2021).

Education financing can have a positive impact on community welfare: Increased Access and Equity: With sufficient education financing, more individuals from different walks of life can access quality education. This can help reduce educational disparities between community groups and provide equal opportunities for everyone to get a decent education (Sulasmi et al., 2023). Government policies have a significant impact on the level and caliber of education that young children get. A number of elements, such as the curriculum, facilities, credentials of teachers, and methods of instruction, can affect the quality of early childhood development (Gunter et al., 2015).

### Discussion

The discussion to support the operations of ECE institutions and improve the quality of early childhood education, the government provides operational assistance to them (Damayanti et al., 2022). There are many ways that the budget for ECE operations can be used to improve early childhood education, such as: 1) Improved Facilities and Infrastructure: With sufficient budget, ECE institutions can repair and upgrade their physical facilities that support learning, such as libraries, playgrounds, and classrooms. 2) Improving the Quality of Educators: To improve the quality of teaching and learning in ECE, an adequate budget can be used for training and development of ECE teachers to meet teacher competency standards. This will have a positive impact on the quality of teaching and learning in ECE. 3) Curriculum Development and Learning Methods: ECD institutions with sufficient budgets can use innovative and effective learning methods and develop curricula appropriate to early childhood development. 4) Procurement of Teaching Materials and Learning Media: You can use the budget to purchase high-quality teaching materials and learning media (Damayanti et al., 2022).

Collaboration between education offices and village governments is essential to ensure the successful implementation of government programs. The government's policy of "one village, one ECE" means that every village should have a dedicated ECE, and village budgets should provide adequate funding for ECE development and operations to ensure program sustainability and effectivenes (Elviana & Fadhly, 2021). The importance of inclusive and equitable early childhood education as a fundamental human right and catalyst for social change. Policy makers, educators and stakeholders can work together to make the education system more inclusive and equitable for all children by using the strategies outlined in this study (Ertz et al., 2022). Teachers were no longer allowed to rely solely on their professional judgment; instead, they had to align their practices with state-defined goals and communicate their work using standardized concepts that might not have originated from their local expertise. This required the Swedish government to articulate the need for legal safeguards and quality assurance in education, reflecting a significant shift in the power dynamics in the educational system (Bergh, 2015).

ECE are crucial to their overall development, it is imperative that early childhood education (ECE) be of the highest caliber. Children's brains are most open to learning and development during this time, so it's the perfect opportunity to set up a solid foundation for future development. Children who participate in highquality early childhood education programs acquire the emotional, social, and cognitive skills necessary for success in school and beyond. These courses aid in the development of critical abilities like language, critical thinking, and self-control, all of which are necessary for both academic and personal success. Furthermore, by



providing every kid with an equal start regardless of background, high-quality early childhood education can lessen social and economic disparities. Thus, nurturing human potential and building a more just and successful society require investing in high-quality early childhood education.



Figure 1. Improve The Quality Of Early Childhood education

# **CONCLUSION**

It is important that action is taken by the government to address disparities in access to education in disadvantaged, frontier and outermost (3T) areas. The various problems faced are discussed in this article, including limited infrastructure, teacher shortages and difficult accessibility. The government is trying to ensure that children in the 3T areas have equal access to early childhood education as children in other areas through appropriate policies, such as the construction of educational facilities, teacher training programs and financial assistance. In addition, this article emphasizes how important it is to work together between the government, non-government agencies and local communities to improve access to education. To find out whether the policy has an impact on improving access and quality of education in the 3T areas, the conclusion is that the role of policy is crucial in establishing equitable access to early childhood education in the 3T areas. To achieve this goal, cooperative efforts and sustained commitment are required.

# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would like to express our deepest gratitude to all those who have contributed to this research. Special thanks to the early childhood educators and parents who participated in the study and provided invaluable insights. We are also grateful for the support and guidance from our colleagues at the Department of Early Childhood Education.

# REFERENCES

- Aslanian, T. K. (2020). "Remove 'care' and stir: Modernizing early childhood teacher education in Norway." *Journal of Education Policy 35*, *4*, 485–502. https://doi.org/10.1080/02680939.2018.1555648
- Bergh, A. (2015). Local quality work in an age of accountability between autonomy and control. *Journal of Education Policy*, *30*(4), 590–607. https://doi.org/10.1080/02680939.2015.1017612
- Britto, P. R., Yoshikawa, H., & Boller, K. (2011). Quality of Early Childhood Development Programs in Global Contexts: Rationale for Investment, Conceptual Framework and Implications for Equity. Social Policy Report. Volume 25, Number 2. Society for Research in Child Development, 25(2), 2011. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED519240
- Brooks, L. E., Kotzé, J., Almeleh, C., & Senona, E. (2022). Assessing the policy options for the public provisioning of early childhood development programmes. *South African Journal on Human Rights* 38, 3(4), 240–260. https://doi.org/10.1080/02587203.2022.2149614
- Brown, M. R., Chavarria, M. M., & Morris, P. (2024). Identifying Policy Flaws: Addressing Educational



Inequities in Early Childhood Education for Young Black Children. In *In Advancing Equity and Inclusion in Early Childhood Education*. IGI Global. https://doi.org/10.4018/979-8-3693-0924-7.ch003

- Damayanti, W. K., Trisnamansyah, S., Khoeriyah, D., & Koswara, N. (2022). Operational Assistance Policy in Improving The Quality of Early Childhood Education. *Indonesian Journal Of Educational Research* and Review, 5(3), 524–534. https://doi.org/10.23887/ijerr.v5i3.52558
- Deuchar, A. (2024). International education policy and/as the limits of humanism: A posthuman critique from the Anthropocene. *Journal of Education Policy*, *39*(5), 755–774. https://doi.org/10.1080/02680939.2023.2245793
- Elviana, I., & Fadhly, Z. (2021). Peran Dinas Pendidikan dalam Mengimplementasikan Kebijakan Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini di Kabupaten Nagan Raya. *Journal of Social and Policy Issues*, 2, 42–48. https://doi.org/10.58835/jspi.v1i2.15
- Ertz, M., Kupaei, H. R., Rad, D., Rede, S, A. R., Roman, A., Ignat, S., Lile, R., Demeter, E., Eger Au, A., Dughi, T., Bala, S, E. B., Maier, R., Kiss, C., Torkos, H., & Rad, G. (2022). Pathways to inclusive and equitable quality early childhood education for achieving SDGG goal-a scoping review. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 1–18. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.955833
- Gunter, H., Hall, D., & Mills, C. (2015). Consultants, consultancy and consultocracy in education policymaking in England. *Journal of Education Policy*, *30*(4), 518–539. https://doi.org/10.1080/02680939.2014.963163
- Hong, X., Liu, P., Ma, Q., & Luo, X. (2015). The way to early childhood education equity policies to tackle the urban-rural disparities in China. *International Journal of Child Care and Education Policy*, 9(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40723-015-0008-9
- Istiqomah, L. (2017). Tiga Pilar Kebijakan Pemerintah Dalam Pembinaan Paud. Golden Age: Jurnal Ilmiah Tumbuh Kembang Anak Usia Dini, 1(2), 57–66. https://doi.org/10.14421/jga.2016.12-05
- Neuman, M. J., & Okeng'o, L. (2019). Early childhood policies in low- and middle-income countries. *Early Years* An International Research Journal, 39(3), 223–228. https://doi.org/10.1080/09575146.2019.1636571
- Rao, N., Umayahara, M., Yang, Y., & Ranganathan, N. (2021). Ensuring access, equity and quality in early childhood education in Bangladesh, China, India and Myanmar: Challenges for nations in a populous economic corridor. *International Journal of Educational Development* 82, 82. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2021.102380
- Semaun, F. (2019). Analisis Penerapan Tiga Pilar Kebijakan Pemerintah Dalam Pembinaan Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini. *DUNIA ANAK: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini*, 1(2), 21–32. https://doi.org/10.31932/jpaud.v1i2.385
- Sulasmi, E., Prasetia, I., & Rahman, A. A. (2023). Government Policy Regarding Education Budget on The Posture of The State Budget (APBN). *Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies*, 6(1), 142–151. https://doi.org/10.23887/jlls.v6i1.60171
- Ulfiaturrohmah, N., Hargianti, N. A., & Diantoro, F. (2021). Peran Tri Pusat Pendidikan Dalam Menghadapi Problematika Pembelajaran Daring Di Daerah 3t. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pemikiran Islam*, 4(2). http://e-journal.stit-islamic-village.ac.id/index.php/istighna
- Waruwu, M. (2023). Pendekatan Penelitian Pendidikan: Metode Penelitian Kualitatif, Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif dan Metode Penelitian Kombinasi (Mixed Method). Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai, 7(1), 2896–2910. https://doi.org/10.36706/jbti.v9i2.18333
- Wright, T. S. (2011). Countering the politics of class, race, gender, and geography in early childhood education. *Educational Policy*, 25(1), 240–261. https://doi.org/10.1177/0895904810387414
- Yang, H., Rao, N., & Pearson, E. (2024). Inequality in access to early childhood care and education programs among 3-to 4-year-olds: Trends and variations across low-and middle-income countries. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 66, 234–244. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2023.10.013